

# On Left 3-Engel elements

Gunnar Traustason

Department of Mathematical Sciences  
University of Bath

Ischia Group Theory 2014

## On left 3-Engel elements

1. Some general background.
2. Left 3-Engel elements in groups.
3. Groups of exponent 5.

# 1. Some general background

Let  $G$  be a group.

# 1. Some general background

Let  $G$  be a group.

**Definition.** An element  $a \in G$  is a **left Engel element**, if for each  $x \in G$  there exists a positive integer  $n = n(x)$  such that

$$[x, {}_n a] = [[\dots [x, a], \dots], a] = 1.$$

# 1. Some general background

Let  $G$  be a group.

**Definition.** An element  $a \in G$  is a **left Engel element**, if for each  $x \in G$  there exists a positive integer  $n = n(x)$  such that

$$[x, {}_n a] = [[\dots [x, a], \dots], a] = 1.$$

If  $n(x)$  is bounded above by  $n$  then we say that  $a$  is a **left  $n$ -Engel element**.

# 1. Some general background

Let  $G$  be a group.

**Definition.** An element  $a \in G$  is a **left Engel element**, if for each  $x \in G$  there exists a positive integer  $n = n(x)$  such that

$$[x, {}_n a] = [[\dots [x, \underbrace{a, \dots, a}_n], \dots], a] = 1.$$

If  $n(x)$  is bounded above by  $n$  then we say that  $a$  is a **left  $n$ -Engel element**.

Every element  $a$  of the locally nilpotent radical  $\text{HP}(G)$  is a left Engel element.

$$\gamma_n(\langle a, a^g \rangle) = \{1\} \Rightarrow [g, {}_n a] = 1.$$

# 1. Some general background

Let  $G$  be a group.

**Definition.** An element  $a \in G$  is a **left Engel element**, if for each  $x \in G$  there exists a positive integer  $n = n(x)$  such that

$$[x, {}_n a] = [\underbrace{[\dots [x, a], \dots]}_n, a] = 1.$$

If  $n(x)$  is bounded above by  $n$  then we say that  $a$  is a **left  $n$ -Engel element**.

Every element  $a$  of the locally nilpotent radical  $\text{HP}(G)$  is a left Engel element.

$$\gamma_n(\langle a, a^g \rangle) = \{1\} \Rightarrow [g, {}_n a] = 1.$$

The converse does not hold in general (Golod's examples). But it does for certain classes like groups satisfying max (Baer) and solvable groups (Gruenberg).

For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.



For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.

Groups of exponent 3.

For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.

**Groups of exponent 3.** If  $G$  is of exponent 3 then any  $a \in G$  is a left 2-Engel element. (Burnside)

For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.

**Groups of exponent 3.** If  $G$  is of exponent 3 then any  $a \in G$  is a left 2-Engel element. (Burnside)

**Groups of exponent  $2^n$ .**

For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.

**Groups of exponent 3.** If  $G$  is of exponent 3 then any  $a \in G$  is a left 2-Engel element. (Burnside)

**Groups of exponent  $2^n$ .** Let  $G$  be a finitely generated group of exponent  $2^n$ . If  $a \in G$  and  $a^2 = 1$  then  $a$  is left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel

$$[x,_{n+1} a] = [x, a]^{(-2)^n} = 1.$$

For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.

**Groups of exponent 3.** If  $G$  is of exponent 3 then any  $a \in G$  is a left 2-Engel element. (Burnside)

**Groups of exponent  $2^n$ .** Let  $G$  be a finitely generated group of exponent  $2^n$ . If  $a \in G$  and  $a^2 = 1$  then  $a$  is left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel

$$[x,_{n+1} a] = [x, a]^{(-2)^n} = 1.$$

If every left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel element in  $G$  is in  $\text{HP}(G)$  and  $G/G^{2^{n-1}}$  is finite, then  $G$  is finite.

For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.

**Groups of exponent 3.** If  $G$  is of exponent 3 then any  $a \in G$  is a left 2-Engel element. (Burnside)

**Groups of exponent  $2^n$ .** Let  $G$  be a finitely generated group of exponent  $2^n$ . If  $a \in G$  and  $a^2 = 1$  then  $a$  is left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel

$$[x,_{n+1} a] = [x, a]^{(-2)^n} = 1.$$

If every left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel element in  $G$  is in  $\text{HP}(G)$  and  $G/G^{2^{n-1}}$  is finite, then  $G$  is finite.

For  $n$  large enough we thus have that there are left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel elements that are not in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

For any group  $G$  a left 2-Engel element  $a$  is contained in  $\text{HP}(G)$  as then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is abelian.

**Groups of exponent 3.** If  $G$  is of exponent 3 then any  $a \in G$  is a left 2-Engel element. (Burnside)

**Groups of exponent  $2^n$ .** Let  $G$  be a finitely generated group of exponent  $2^n$ . If  $a \in G$  and  $a^2 = 1$  then  $a$  is left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel

$$[x,_{n+1} a] = [x, a]^{(-2)^n} = 1.$$

If every left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel element in  $G$  is in  $\text{HP}(G)$  and  $G/G^{2^{n-1}}$  is finite, then  $G$  is finite.

For  $n$  large enough we thus have that there are left  $(n + 1)$ -Engel elements that are not in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

If the left 4-Engel elements are in  $\text{HP}(G)$  then groups of exponent 8 are locally finite.

## 2. Left 3-Engel elements



## 2. Left 3-Engel elements

**Theorem** (Abdollahi). If  $a \in G$  is left 3-Engel of  $p$ -power order then  $a^p \in \text{HP}(G)$ . Any two left 3-Engel elements generate a subgroup that is nilpotent of class at most 4

## 2. Left 3-Engel elements

**Theorem** (Abdollahi). If  $a \in G$  is left 3-Engel of  $p$ -power order then  $a^p \in \text{HP}(G)$ . Any two left 3-Engel elements generate a subgroup that is nilpotent of class at most 4

$a \in G$  is left 3-Engel if and only if  $\langle a, a^g \rangle$  is nilpotent of class at most 2 for all  $g \in G$

## 2. Left 3-Engel elements

**Theorem** (Abdollahi). If  $a \in G$  is left 3-Engel of  $p$ -power order then  $a^p \in \text{HP}(G)$ . Any two left 3-Engel elements generate a subgroup that is nilpotent of class at most 4

$a \in G$  is left 3-Engel if and only if  $\langle a, a^g \rangle$  is nilpotent of class at most 2 for all  $g \in G$

**Definition.** A **sandwich group** is a group  $G$  generated by a set  $X$  of elements such that  $\langle x, y^g \rangle$  is nilpotent of class at most 2 for all  $x, y \in X$  and all  $g \in G$ .

## 2. Left 3-Engel elements

**Theorem** (Abdollahi). If  $a \in G$  is left 3-Engel of  $p$ -power order then  $a^p \in \text{HP}(G)$ . Any two left 3-Engel elements generate a subgroup that is nilpotent of class at most 4

$a \in G$  is left 3-Engel if and only if  $\langle a, a^g \rangle$  is nilpotent of class at most 2 for all  $g \in G$

**Definition.** A **sandwich group** is a group  $G$  generated by a set  $X$  of elements such that  $\langle x, y^g \rangle$  is nilpotent of class at most 2 for all  $x, y \in X$  and all  $g \in G$ .

**TFAE:** (1) Left 3 Engel elements are always contained in the locally nilpotent radical.

(2) Every sandwich group is locally nilpotent.

**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition.** A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Theorem**(T). Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition**. A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Proposition**(T). Any group  $G = \langle a, b, c \rangle$  of type  $(1, 2, 2)$  is polycyclic.

**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition.** A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Proposition(T).** Any group  $G = \langle a, b, c \rangle$  of type  $(1, 2, 2)$  is polycyclic.

**Proof of solvability** (when  $G$  is a torsion group without involutions). As  $\langle c \rangle^{\langle a \rangle}$  is abelian and  $1 = [c, a, a]$ , we have

$$c^{a^2} = c^{2a}c^{-1}, \quad c^{a^{-1}} = c^2c^{-a}.$$



**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition.** A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Proposition(T).** Any group  $G = \langle a, b, c \rangle$  of type  $(1, 2, 2)$  is polycyclic.

**Proof of solvability** (when  $G$  is a torsion group without involutions). As  $\langle c \rangle^{\langle a \rangle}$  is abelian and  $1 = [c, a, a]$ , we have

$$c^{a^2} = c^{2a}c^{-1}, \quad c^{a^{-1}} = c^2c^{-a}.$$

Using the fact that  $c, c^{ab}$  commute with  $c^a, c^b$ , one sees that

**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition.** A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Proposition(T).** Any group  $G = \langle a, b, c \rangle$  of type  $(1, 2, 2)$  is polycyclic.

**Proof of solvability** (when  $G$  is a torsion group without involutions). As  $\langle c \rangle^{\langle a \rangle}$  is abelian and  $1 = [c, a, a]$ , we have

$$c^{a^2} = c^{2a}c^{-1}, \quad c^{a^{-1}} = c^2c^{-a}.$$

Using the fact that  $c, c^{ab}$  commute with  $c^a, c^b$ , one sees that

$$1 = [c^{a^2b}, c^{a^2}] = [c^{2ab}c^{-b}, c^{2a}c^{-1}]$$

**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition.** A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Proposition(T).** Any group  $G = \langle a, b, c \rangle$  of type  $(1, 2, 2)$  is polycyclic.

**Proof of solvability** (when  $G$  is a torsion group without involutions). As  $\langle c \rangle^{\langle a \rangle}$  is abelian and  $1 = [c, a, a]$ , we have

$$c^{a^2} = c^{2a}c^{-1}, \quad c^{a^{-1}} = c^2c^{-a}.$$

Using the fact that  $c, c^{ab}$  commute with  $c^a, c^b$ , one sees that

$$1 = [c^{a^2b}, c^{a^2}] = [c^{2ab}c^{-b}, c^{2a}c^{-1}] = \dots = [c^{2ab}, c^{-1}][c^{-b}, c^{2a}].$$

**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition.** A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Proposition(T).** Any group  $G = \langle a, b, c \rangle$  of type  $(1, 2, 2)$  is polycyclic.

**Proof of solvability** (when  $G$  is a torsion group without involutions). As  $\langle c \rangle^{\langle a \rangle}$  is abelian and  $1 = [c, a, a]$ , we have

$$c^{a^2} = c^{2a}c^{-1}, \quad c^{a^{-1}} = c^2c^{-a}.$$

Using the fact that  $c, c^{ab}$  commute with  $c^a, c^b$ , one sees that

$$1 = [c^{a^2b}, c^{a^2}] = [c^{2ab}c^{-b}, c^{2a}c^{-1}] = \dots = [c^{2ab}, c^{-1}][c^{-b}, c^{2a}].$$

Hence  $[c^{-1}, c^{2ab}] = [c^{-b}, c^{2a}]$  that commutes with  $c^b, c^a, c, c^{ab}$  and is therefore in  $Z(\langle c^G \rangle)$ .

**Theorem(T).** Every 3-generator sandwich group is nilpotent.

**Definition.** A 3-generator group  $\langle a, b, c \rangle$  is **pairwise nilpotent of type  $(r, s, t)$**  if  $\langle a, b \rangle$ ,  $\langle a, c \rangle$  and  $\langle b, c \rangle$  are nilpotent of class  $r$ ,  $s$  and  $t$  respectively.

**Proposition(T).** Any group  $G = \langle a, b, c \rangle$  of type  $(1, 2, 2)$  is polycyclic.

**Proof of solvability** (when  $G$  is a torsion group without involutions). As  $\langle c \rangle^{\langle a \rangle}$  is abelian and  $1 = [c, a, a]$ , we have

$$c^{a^2} = c^{2a}c^{-1}, \quad c^{a^{-1}} = c^2c^{-a}.$$

Using the fact that  $c, c^{ab}$  commute with  $c^a, c^b$ , one sees that

$$1 = [c^{a^2b}, c^{a^2}] = [c^{2ab}c^{-b}, c^{2a}c^{-1}] = \dots = [c^{2ab}, c^{-1}][c^{-b}, c^{2a}].$$

Hence  $[c^{-1}, c^{2ab}] = [c^{-b}, c^{2a}]$  that commutes with  $c^b, c^a, c, c^{ab}$  and is therefore in  $Z(\langle c^G \rangle)$ . Thus  $\langle c \rangle^G$  is nilpotent and  $G/\langle c \rangle^G$  abelian. Hence  $G$  is solvable.

### 3. Groups of exponent 5

### 3. Groups of exponent 5

**Theorem(T).** Let  $G$  be a group of exponent 5 then every left 3-Engel element is in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

### 3. Groups of exponent 5

**Theorem**(T). Let  $G$  be a group of exponent 5 then every left 3-Engel element is in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

**Fact.** If  $G$  is a finite group of exponent 5 and  $a \in G$ , then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is nilpotent of class at most 6.



### 3. Groups of exponent 5

**Theorem(T).** Let  $G$  be a group of exponent 5 then every left 3-Engel element is in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

**Fact.** If  $G$  is a finite group of exponent 5 and  $a \in G$ , then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is nilpotent of class at most 6.

**Theorem(T).** A group of exponent 5 is locally finite if and only if it satisfies the law

$$[z, [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x]] = 1.$$

### 3. Groups of exponent 5

**Theorem(T).** Let  $G$  be a group of exponent 5 then every left 3-Engel element is in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

**Fact.** If  $G$  is a finite group of exponent 5 and  $a \in G$ , then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is nilpotent of class at most 6.

**Theorem(T).** A group of exponent 5 is locally finite if and only if it satisfies the law

$$[z, [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x]] = 1.$$

**Proof( $\Leftarrow$ ).** Replacing  $G$  by  $G/\text{HP}(G)$  we can suppose that  $\text{HP}(G)$  is trivial and we want to show that  $G = \{1\}$ .

### 3. Groups of exponent 5

**Theorem(T).** Let  $G$  be a group of exponent 5 then every left 3-Engel element is in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

**Fact.** If  $G$  is a finite group of exponent 5 and  $a \in G$ , then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is nilpotent of class at most 6.

**Theorem(T).** A group of exponent 5 is locally finite if and only if it satisfies the law

$$[z, [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x]] = 1.$$

**Proof( $\Leftarrow$ ).** Replacing  $G$  by  $G/\text{HP}(G)$  we can suppose that  $\text{HP}(G)$  is trivial and we want to show that  $G = \{1\}$ . Let  $a, b, c \in G$ . As  $[b, a, a, a]$  is a left 3-Engel element it is in  $\text{HP}(G)$  and is thus trivial. Thus  $G$  satisfies the law  $[y, x, x, x] = 1$

### 3. Groups of exponent 5

**Theorem(T).** Let  $G$  be a group of exponent 5 then every left 3-Engel element is in  $\text{HP}(G)$ .

**Fact.** If  $G$  is a finite group of exponent 5 and  $a \in G$ , then  $\langle a \rangle^G$  is nilpotent of class at most 6.

**Theorem(T).** A group of exponent 5 is locally finite if and only if it satisfies the law

$$[z, [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x], [y, x, x, x]] = 1.$$

**Proof( $\Leftarrow$ ).** Replacing  $G$  by  $G/\text{HP}(G)$  we can suppose that  $\text{HP}(G)$  is trivial and we want to show that  $G = \{1\}$ . Let  $a, b, c \in G$ . As  $[b, a, a, a]$  is a left 3-Engel element it is in  $\text{HP}(G)$  and is thus trivial. Thus  $G$  satisfies the law  $[y, x, x, x] = 1$  and all elements are left 3-Engel and hence in  $\text{HP}(G) = \{1\}$ . It follows that  $G = \{1\}$ .